AN ANALYSIS OF LEADERSHIP PERSPECTIVES EMBEDDED IN THE MULTIDIMENSIONAL RUBRIC

A research paper submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for

EDU 5571, Advanced Leadership

Professor Frank Smith, Ph.D.

Of the Division of

ADMINISTRATIVE AND INSTRUCTIONAL LEADERSHIP

Of

THE SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

ST. JOHN'S UNIVERSITY

Oakdale, N.Y.

by

Denise Smith

Christopher Kelly

and

Samuel Thompson

Table of Contents

Chapter		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	3
	Purpose of the Study	4
	Statement of the Problem	4
	Summary	4
	Research Question	5
Chapter		
II.	REVIEW OF LITERATURE	6
Chapter		
III.	METHODOLOGY	11
	Problem	11
	Data Collection.	12
	Data Analysis	12
Chapter		
IV.	. FINDINGS	17
Chapter		
V.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	17

Multidimensional Rubric Analysis		

REFERENCES 19

2

Chapter 1

Introduction

National and statewide initiatives have begun to reform public school education and the federal government has written legislation, the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act of 2009 (ARRA). This legislation established funds to motivate states to develop strategies to improve results and the efficacy of teaching and learning. The Race to the Top (RTTT) is a \$4.35 billion competitive grant program designed to encourage and reward states that are creating conditions for education innovation and reform and are achieving significant improvement in student outcomes. This program is the largest discretionary funding package for education ever offered by the US Department of Education and New York State is among only four states eligible for the largest grants — up to\$700 million...awards will be given to a select number of states that will 'trail-blaze effective reforms and provide examples for states and local school districts throughout the country' by demonstrating coordinated, deep-seated commitment to education reform. The Four Assurances are:

- Adopting internationally-benchmarked standards and assessments that prepare students for success in college and the workplace.
- Recruiting, developing, retaining, and rewarding effective teachers and principals.
- Building instructional data systems that measure student success and inform teachers and principals how they can improve their practices.
- Turning around the lowest-performing schools (www.scribd.com/doc/24374257/NYS-Race-To-The-Top-Summary).

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study is to examine the Multidimensional Rubric for alignment with prevalent leadership values. The predominant perspective will be revealed through this type of analysis. Leadership perspectives vary in communicating attributes of effective leadership. An analysis of leadership perspectives using literature sources on the topic and the Multidimensional Rubric will reveal one model of leadership.

Statement of the Problem

Part of RTTT is the adoption of a school principal evaluation form that will be used by school districts across New York State, the Multidimensional Rubric. The Multidimensional Rubric aims to communicate efficacy in educational leadership. School districts will use the rubric to evaluate principals based on the prevalent model of leadership. Educational leadership perspectives and concepts from research may or may not concur with the perspective of the Multidimensional Rubric.

Summary

Data analysis on leadership attributes guides this research. This type of analysis provides an understanding of educational leadership perspectives from which to view the Multidimensional Rubric. The research will present literature from different educational perspectives in Chapter II. How the data is used to complete the final analysis matrix is found in the third chapter of the research. The fourth chapter offers a final analysis of evaluation of

principal practice using a matrix of acquired terms for leadership. Finally, recommendations and conclusions sum up the findings in the final chapter of the study.

Research Questions

The overarching question used to guide the research is:

1. How do embedded leadership perspectives of the Multidimensional Rubric align to established leadership values?

An additional research question that emanates from the overarching question and shapes the study includes:

2. What is the predominant leadership perspective embedded in the Multidimensional Rubric?

Chapter II

Review of Literature

The Race to the Top (RTTT) is a \$4.35 billion competitive grant program designed to encourage and reward States that are creating conditions for education innovation and reform and are achieving significant improvement in student outcomes. This program is the largest discretionary funding package for education ever offered by the U.S. Department of Education, and New York State is among only four states eligible for the largest grants, which is up to \$700 million. Awards will be given to a select number of states which will 'trail-blaze effective reforms and provide examples for states and local school districts throughout the country' by demonstrating coordinated, deep-seated commitment to education reform.

The Multidimensional Rubric utilizes the Interstate School Leaders Licensure

Consortium (ISLLC) standards as the basis for creating six domains and one goal setting /

attainment category. These seven areas are used to evaluate and assess the quality of school

principals (Learner – Centered Initiatives, Ltd., 2011). The areas of assessment are as follows:

shared vision of learning, school culture and instructional program, safe efficient effective

learning environment, community, integrity fairness ethics, political social economic legal and

culture context, and goal setting and attainment (Learner-Centered Initiatives, Ltd.). In each

domain, artifacts are coded in a four level nominal system of: ineffective, developing, effective

and highly-effective (Learner-centered Initiatives, Ltd). Research from educational theorists will

be cited to examine how closely aligned this rubric is to similar principles as the theorists.

Toyota's methods for making extensive use of its human capital served as the subject for several decades' worth of research and analysis into their manufacturing methods. Spear and

Bowen (1999) conducted an analysis of what made the Toyota Production System so highly effective. They discovered Toyota uses a rigorous problem-solving process that requires a detailed assessment of the current state of affairs and a plan for improving that is, in effect, an experimental test of the proposed changes. This work by Spear and Bowen reveals that there are, indeed, connections between internal processes that are mitigated by knowledge management. They go on to depict situations where not managing knowledge leads to a significant loss in performance. Other companies devote substantial resources to coordinate people, but their connections generally aren't so direct and unambiguous. In most plants, requests for material or assistance often take a convoluted route from the line worker to the supplier via an intermediary. Any supervisor can answer any call for help because a specific person has not been assigned. The disadvantage of that approach, as Toyota recognizes, is that when something is everyone's problem it becomes no one's problem.

The Lawrence A. Cremin text, *Popular Education and its Discontents*, approaches the crisis in education from a political standpoint. In his article he discusses the role schools play as institutions for social change. Cremin's belief is the American Education Tendency will place education in a position to solve social and political issues. He debunks the traditional thinking of the goal of education is to make students global competitors or individuals who reach a level of success. Ultimately Cremin views the purpose of education as a means to provide students with an experience that will lead to becoming better citizens rather than learners, that students become an integral part of a societal network that gives back to their community rather than take from it.

In an interview by Brandt of Thomas Sergiovanni(1992), he contends first that schools should consider themselves to be communities rather than organizations. He proposes that the

concept of an organization, like that of leadership, is something that is imposed instead of coming naturally from within the school environment. In his opinion, this is appropriate for corporations, where the focus is on the bottom line, but is not especially useful in education. Sergiovanni contends that leadership is frequently responsible for reducing individual responsibility for making educational systems effective. Instead of the corporate model, he suggests a method of administration he calls "moral leadership" which relies on building a sense of community within the school. Sergiovanni believes that this will create a climate in which teachers will embrace professional development instead of having it imposed on them, and focus on the overall effectiveness of the school's work, rather than simply worrying about their individual classrooms. Although some of his points are disputed, moral leadership does offer a promising approach and has been shown to work often enough to prove a useful concept.

The framework for the Advocacy Design Center (ADC) was developed by Dr. Frank Smith (1990) and is the tool to analyze the function of each alternative high school. The ADC uses 29 questions that serve as a guide to examine four areas: instruction, organization, governance and accountability (IOGA). The primary purpose of the ADC Model is community building; strengthening the school's sense of efficacy and its capacity to be a powerful institution in its' social context. According to Frank Smith in the Advocacy Design Study model, effective schools ask themselves tough questions and have a meaningful relationship between inquiry and accountability. On the other hand, less effective schools view themselves as victims. Smith maintains that data must be made public to ensure accountability. By doing so, schools are forced to work together to problem solve in a constructive and meaningful way as opposed to the more "technical" top-down method that many schools and districts experience.

Smith looks at the importance of organization in schools. Smith believes that in more successful schools, teachers do not operate as independent agents; rather there is a strong sense of interdependence and more public collaboration. Rather than take students and send them to the resident "experts", such as school reading or math specialists, essentially all students are viewed as "our kids" not "my kids" or "your kids". The basic premise of the ADC model is that in many cases leadership should not approach school improvement as something that needs to be fixed, rather as something that needs to be redesigned (Smith, 2010).

Clarence Stone (2004) believes that all stakeholders should be involved and accountable in the educational process and that an action plan is necessary in order to solve a problem.

According to C. Stone, the school is a central pillar of institutional power in the community. In his research, Stone highlights civic capacity in four case studies: Kent County, Maryland; El Paso, Texas; Boston, Massachusetts; and Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

Table 2.1 represents a collaboration of the Leadership Concepts and sources used to define our terms for the rubric. Upon review and examination of leadership theories presented by the authors above, a glossary of the important terms was created for each theorist.

Table 2.1The Leadership Concepts and Sources used to define our terms

Term	Definition
Accountability	Accountability is the process through which public knowledge about school work is created. Its purpose is to test whether the selected means were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand what action led to results and what we value how well we like what we got as results (Smith).
Civic Capacity	The idea based organization whereby moral authority inspires all persons to take up a role of serving the enterprise (Sergiovanni) to attend to common problems collaboratively (Smith).
Culture	A known design of a school which embodies a sense of identifies and character and serves as a set of beliefs and practices (Smith) which are connected to the cultural side of school (Sergiovanni).
Governance	Referring to the system by which members of the school identify problems, express preferences, generate hypothesis about action, and make decisions about the connection between the ends they desire and the means

they intend to use to achieve them: what is to be done and how define by the process by which a viable consensus is reached among all stakeholders as they work together for a stronger school (Smith).

Instruction The alternative strategy that moves from the whole to the parts and is referred to as the cognitive, transactional,

or constructive approach which involves efforts to build concepts through reflection and discussion about direct

experiences with work or what students "do" and know (Smith)

Instructional Leader Is the traditional view of the principal whereby he/she understands instruction the best and all others become

followers (Sergiovanni).

Leadership is a moral act, not a neutral technical act devoid of moral consequences and requires a clear set of

values (Smith), with the inspiration for becoming the greatest servant in a community; to uphold and foster the

positive cultural environment (Sergiovanni).

Learning Organization A system that stimulates workers and managers to engage in experimentation (Spears & Bowen).

Organization Refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's

sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and

isolated (Smith).

Paradox of the System Activities, connections and production flows in a Toyota factory are rigidly scripted, yet at the same time

Toyota's operations are enormously flexible and adaptable (Spears & Bowen).

Politicization of Education The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin).

School Community Demonstrating a large social responsibility (Cremin) which includes the schools and community (Smith).

Scientific Method Detailed assessment of the current state of affairs and a plan for improvement with an experimental test of the

proposed changes (Spears & Bowen).

Social Capacity Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in

quality schooling and a prosperous community life (Smith).

Relational Trust The quality of social relationships in school communities with regard to respect, trust, personal regard for others,

competence and integrity in different role relationships (teachers with principals, teachers with parents, teachers

with other teachers, teachers with students) (Bryk & Schneider).

Chapter III

Methodology

Two components of Race to the Top include:

- Recruiting, developing, retaining, and rewarding effective teachers and principals
- Building instructional data systems that measure student success and inform teachers and principals how they can improve their practices

In an effort to accurately access the measurement of effective teachers and principals, several rubrics have been proposed. One of those suggested is the Multidimensional Principal Performance Rubric. This rubric is comprised of six domains which access various areas of educational leadership and rates the leader on a one to four scale; one as ineffective and four as highly effective. Under each rating in the rubric are descriptors to assist in the evaluation.

Statement of the Problem

Part of RTTT is the adoption of a school principal evaluation form that will be used by school districts across New York State, the Multidimensional Rubric. The Multidimensional Rubric aims to communicate efficacy in educational leadership. School districts will use the rubric to evaluate principals based on the prevalent model of leadership. Educational leadership perspectives and concepts from research may or may not concur with the perspective of the Multidimensional Rubric. How do embedded leadership perspectives of the Multidimensional Rubric align to established leadership values as presented by Anthony S. Bryk and Barbara Schneider, Lawrence A. Cremin, Thomas Sergiovanni, Dr. Frank Smith, Steven Spear and H.

Kent Bowen, and Clarence Stone? What is the predominant leadership perspective embedded in the Multidimensional Rubric?

Data Collection

Upon review and examination of leadership theories presented by the authors above, a glossary of the important terms was created for each theorist. Included in the glossary were terms composed from the perspectives of the theorists. After each glossary was created, all glossaries were compared and gleaned creating a metaglossary list of 15 terms that demonstrated a pattern and theme across all of the glossaries. Under each of these 15 terms, a definition was created to reflect a culmination of all of the individual glossaries.

Data Analysis

Each term in the metaglossary was reviewed with the six domains in the Multidimensional Principal Performance Rubric. The matrix below (Table 3.1) displays the domains as each of six columns (with a seventh column for "other") and each row representing the metaglossary terms and the final definition assigned to each by the research team. The empty cells in the matrix shown in Table 3.1 will contain the descriptors from the Multidimensional Principal Performance Rubric if a term from the metaglossary falls under one of the domains thereby aligning a leadership term with a domain from the rubric.

Matrix comparing the six domains of the New York State Multidimensional Principal Performance Rubric with the leadership concepts of Anthony S. Bryk and Barbara Schneider, Lawrence A. Cremin, Thomas Sergiovanni, Frank Smith, Steven Spear and H. Kent Bowen, and Clarence Stone.

Table 3.1

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
	Shared Vision of	School Culture and	Safe, Efficient, Effective	Community	Integrity, Fairness,	Political, Social, Economic,	Other
	Learning	Instructional	Learning Environment	The education leader	Ethics	Legal & Culture Context	Goals, Settings
	The education leader	Program	The education leader	promotes the success of	The education leader	The education leader	and Attainment
	promotes the success of	An educational leader	promotes the success of	every student by	promotes the success of	promotes the success of	
	every student by	promotes the success	every student by ensuring	collaborating with	every student by acting	every student by	
	facilitating the	of every student by	management of the	faculty and community	with integrity fairness	understanding, responding	
	development articulation	advocating nurturing	organization, operation and	members responding to	and an ethical manner	to, and influencing for a	
	implementation and	and sustaining a	resources for a safe	diverse community		political, social, economic,	
	stewardship of the vision	school culture and	efficient and effective	interest and needs and		legal and cultural context	
	of learning that is shared	instructional program	learning environment	mobilizing			
	and supported by all stake	conducive to student		community resources			
	holders	learning and staff					
		professional growth					
Instructional Leader - the							
traditional view of the principal							
whereby he/she understands							
instruction the best and all							
others become followers							
(Sergiovanni).							
Leadership – Leadership is a							
moral act, not a neutral							
technical act devoid of moral							
consequences and requires a							
clear set of values (Smith),							
with the inspiration for							
becoming the greatest servant							
in a community; to uphold and foster the positive cultural							
environment (Sergiovanni).							
Instruction – The alternative							
strategy that moves from the							
whole to the parts and is							
referred to as the cognitive,							
transactional, or constructive							
approach which involves							
efforts to build concepts							
through reflection and							
discussion about direct							
experiences with work or what							
students "do" and know							
(Smith).							

Governance- Referring to the				
system by which members of				
the school identify problems,				
express preferences, generate				
hypothesis about action, and				
make decisions about the				
connection between the ends				
they desire and the means they				
intend to use to achieve them;				
what is to be done and how it is				
defined by the process by				
which a viable consensus is				
reached among all stakeholders				
as they work together for a				
stronger school (Smith).				
Culture – A known design of a				
school which embodies a sense				
of identity and character and				
serves as a set of beliefs and				
practices (Smith) which are				
connected to the cultural side				
of school (Sergiovanni).				
Civic Capacity - The idea				
based organization whereby				
moral authority inspires all				
persons to take up a role of				
serving the enterprise				
(Sergiovanni) to attend to				
common problems				
collaboratively (Smith).				
School Community-				
Demonstrating a large social				
responsibility (Cremin) which includes the schools and				
community (Smith).				
Learning Organization - A system that stimulates workers				
and managers to engage in				
experimentation(Spears &				
Bowen).				
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
Paradox of the System -				
Activities, connections and				
production flows in a Toyota				
factory are rigidly scripted, yet				
at the same time Toyota's				
operations are enormously				
flexible and adaptable(Spears				

& Bowen). Securities Wathout Detailed some and some a					
assessment of the current state of a faliars and a plant for improvement with an experimental test of the proposed changes (Speas & Part of the Common of th	& Bowen).				
assessment of the current state of a faliars and a plant for improvement with an experimental test of the proposed changes (Speas & Particular Speas & Particular Spe	Scientific Method Detailed	1			
of affairs and a plan for improvement with an experimental test of the proposed changes (Spear & Bowen). Accountability Accountability Accountability Accountability I suppose is to test whether the selected mans were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge about an accountability has but an at a calculation of the selected mans were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has but an at value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand what action led to results and what we value how well we like what we value how well we like what we we are sensits. Somith). Politicization of Education The isological buttles that are forged and forgit though (Ceremin). Organization refers to the pattern of purposed irelations within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interedependent or is griven and isolated Smith). School Capacity Ability of a social group to articulate and an avolving their common interest in quality schooling and a properous community.		!			
improvement with an experimental test of the proposed changes (Spears & Bowen). Accountability - Accountability is the process through which public of the process of the proces		!			
experimental test of the proposed changes (Spears & Bowen). Accountability is the process through which public knowledge about school work is created. Its purpose is to test whether the selected means were sufficient to achieve the accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand — what action led to results — and what we wader—how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education — The ideological bartles that are forged and fought through echocational institution (Cremish). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposed the lations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest School behavior varies in the degree to which it is considered in the provision of the pr	improvement with an				
proposed changes (Spears & Bowen). Accountability : the process through which public knowledge about school work is created. Its purpose is to test whether the selected means were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for district the sense will be a sense of the s		!			
Bowen). Accountability is the process through which public knowledge about school work is created. Its purpose is to test whether the selected mems were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, secreted and, it is sense, and the sense of the selected mems were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, and the sense of the sense o					
Accountability is the process through which public knowledge about school work is created. Its purpose is to test whether the selected means were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand — what are decided end to sense the sense of t		!			
Accountability is the process through which public knowledge about school work is created. Its purpose is to test whether the selected means were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand — what action led to results— and what we value — how well we like what we value — sensitis— and what we value — how well we like what we go are assisted. Similarly. Politication of Education— the ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization—refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interess. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interedpendent or is private and isolated. Similarly of a social group to a triculate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperore community		 			
through which public knowledge about school work is created. Its purpose is to test whether the selected means were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand — what action led to results — and what we value — how well we hike what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education The ideological battles that are finged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of as social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	Accountability is the process	!			
knowledge about school work is created. Its purpose is to test whether the selected means were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand — what action led to results— and what we value — how well we like what we go are results. Cambible. Politicization of Education— The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and is obtact (Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	through which public	!			
is created. Its purpose is to test whether the selected means were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand — what action led to results — and what we value — how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education - The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated (Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	knowledge about seheel work	!			
whether the selected means were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand — what action led to results — and what we value — how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education— The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's aphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated (Smith). Social Copporty—Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	is arrested. Its marmage is to test	!			
were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand what action led to results and what we value how well we like what we quite sensitist and what we value how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interephendent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	is created. its purpose is to test	!			
desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand - what action led to results - and what we walue - how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education - The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school so phere or interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interediendent or is private and isolated(Gsmith). Social Capacity. Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
public knowledge for accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand what action led to results and what we value how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education - The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity-Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand what action led to results and what we understand what action led to results and what we value how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education - The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity - Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prospersus community		!			
informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand – what action led to results – and what we value – how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education – The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity - Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling had a prosperous community	public knowledge for	!			
value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand — what action led to results — and what we value — how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education — The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity - Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	accountability has both an	!			
knowledge accounts both for what we understand — what action led to results — and what we value — how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education— The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity—Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
what we understand what action led to results and what we value how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education - The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity - Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community					
action led to results and what we value how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education - The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
we value — how well we like what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education — The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
what we got as results (Smith). Politicization of Education - The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interests. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community					
Politicization of Education - The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity - Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity - Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community					
forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity - Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community					
educational institution (Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity - Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
(Cremin). Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity - Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	forged and fought through	!			
Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	(Cremin).				
pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	Organization - refers to the				
that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community					
within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	within the boundaries of the	!			
interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	interest. School behavior varies				
private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community					
private and isolated(Smith). Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		!			
Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	private and isolated(Smith).	!			
social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	Social Capacity- Ability of a				
work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community	social group to articulate and	1			
involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		1			
interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community		1			
and a prosperous community	interest in quality schooling	1			
		1			
		1			

Relational Trust – The quality				
of social relationships in school				
communities with regard to				
respect, trust, personal regard				
for others, competence and				
integrity in different role				
relationships (teachers with				
principals, teachers with				
parents, teachers with other				
teachers, teachers with				
students(Bryk & Schneider).				

Chapter IV

This chapter represents the findings of the analysis of the evaluation of our rubric. The empty cells in the matrix shown in Table 3.1 were filled in with the descriptors from the Multidimensional Principal Performance Rubric when a term from the metaglossary fell under one of the domains thereby aligning a leadership term with a domain from the rubric. The resulting matrix is below as Table 4.1.

Two terms were left blank as there was no evidence that they fit under any of the six domains presented in the rubric. Those terms were Paradox of the System and Organization. Noteworthy is part of the description for the term Organization that includes, "school behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated." There was no language in the rubric to support this description. However, for this analysis it is a supporting trait for successful educational leaders. Two terms consistently embedded in the rubric were Leadership and Governance. The existence of an abundance of language relative to the two terms indicated in many areas of the rubric suggests that the creators of this particular assessment value the same characteristics as those terms developed by the researchers for this analysis. Our glossary defines leadership as a "moral act, not a neutral technical act devoid of moral consequences and requiring a clear set of values (Smith) with the inspiration for becoming the greatest servant in a community; to uphold and foster the positive cultural environment (Sergiovanni)." This term was found in the majority of domains. It was found under domains two, four, five and six. The rubric defines those domains as: School Culture and Instructional Program; Community; Integrity, Fairness, Ethics; and Political, Social, Economic, Legal and Culture context. Leadership should be marked by acts that support servant leadership and supports a positive cultural environment.

Additionally, Governance is defined in our glossary as "the system by which members of the school identify problems, express preferences, generate hypothesis about action, and make decisions about the connection between the ends they desire and the means they intend to use to achieve them: what is to be done and how define by the process by which a viable consensus is reached among all stakeholders as they work together for a stronger school (Smith)."

Accordingly, a rich set of indicators support the researchers' description for this term, as it was found under domains one, two, three and five. The rubric defines those domains as: Shared Vision of Learning; School Culture and Instructional Program; Safe, Efficient, Effective Learning Environment; and Integrity, Fairness, Ethics.

What is the predominant leadership perspective embedded in the Multidimensional Rubric? Intended in this analysis was a determination on the predominant leadership perspective. As pointed out, Leadership and Governance indicators were found throughout the rubric. This suggests that a leadership perspective which includes a focus on the instructional program, collaboration with the school community, ethical and fair acts, and responds in a political, social, economic and legal context are the prescribed qualities of an educational leader. The perspective also includes the ability for an educational leader to promote and communicate the school vision when collaborating with all stakeholders to develop and attain goals.

Table 4.1

Matrix comparing the six domains of the New York State Multidimensional Principal Performance Rubric with the alignment of the leadership concepts of Anthony S. Bryk and Barbara Schneider, Lawrence A. Cremin, Thomas Sergiovanni, Frank Smith, Steven Spear and H. Kent Bowen, and Clarence Stone.

Note: The coded tags following cell descriptors represent Domain; Rubric Criteria Level; Section; Section Descriptor respectively.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
	Shared Vision of	School Culture and	Safe, Efficient,	Community	Integrity, Fairness,	Political, Social,	Other
	Learning	Instructional	Effective Learning	The education leader	Ethics	Economic, Legal &	Goals, Settings and
	The education leader	Program	Environment	promotes the success	The education leader	Culture Context	Attainment
	promotes the success	An educational leader	The education leader	of every student by	promotes the success	The education leader	
	of every student by	promotes the success	promotes the success	collaborating with	of every student by	promotes the success	
	facilitating the	of every student by	of every student by	faculty and community	acting with integrity	of every student by	
	development	advocating nurturing	ensuring management	members responding to	fairness and an ethical	understanding,	
	articulation	and sustaining a school	of the organization,	diverse community	manner	responding to, and	
	implementation and	culture and	operation and	interest and needs and		influencing for a	
	stewardship of the	instructional program	resources for a safe	mobilizing community		political, social,	
	vision of learning that	conducive to student	efficient and effective	resources		economic, legal and	
	is shared and supported	learning and staff	learning environment			cultural context	
	by all stake holders	professional growth					
Instructional Leader	"assumes that the	"create a learning		"makes decisions			
- the traditional view	school's improvement	environment in which		about whether or not to			
of the principal	is either an event or the	students are passive		change the educational			
whereby he/she	responsibility of a	recipients in learning		environment based on			
understands instruction	single individual"	opportunities that are		own impressions and			
the best and all others	(1.1.Sustain.1)	only peripherally		beliefs"			
become followers		connected to their		4.1.stragtegic			
(Sergiovanni).		experiences or		planning.1)			
		cultures"					
		(2.2.Culture.3)					
		"provides mixed					
		1					
		messages related to expectations for					
		instructional					
		methodology and own					
		understanding of "best					
		practice" (2.2.I.P.2)					
Leadership –		"engages students and		"promotes	"models principles of	"guided by the school	
Leadership is a moral		teachers in designing		understanding,	self-awareness,	vision, enables self,	
act, not a neutral		and revising a learner-		appreciation, and use	reflective practice,	children, families and	
technical act devoid of		centered curricular		of the community's	transparency, and	caregivers to	
moral consequences		program that integrates		diverse cultural, social,	ethical behavior"	successfully and	
and requires a clear set		basic and higher levels		and intellectual	(5.3.cutlure.1)	appropriately advocate	
of values (Smith), with		of thinking throughout		resources through		for themselves and one	
the inspiration for		and provides		diverse activities"		another"	

			7-4-4-45	T T
becoming the greatest	opportunities for	(4.3.cutlure.1)	(6.4.culture.1)	
servant in a	students to emulate			
community; to uphold	professionals and			
and foster the positive	construct meaning as			
cultural environment	they engage in a			
(Sergiovanni).	thorough exploration			
, ,	of a concept, problem,			
	issue or question.			
	(2.3.Culture.3)			
Instruction – The	"creates a personalized			
alternative strategy that	and motivating			
moves from the whole	learning environment			
	for students in which			
to the parts and is				
referred to as the	they are involved in			
cognitive,	meaningful and			
transactional, or	relevant learning			
constructive approach	opportunities that they			
	opportunities that they			
which involves efforts	recognize as connected			
to build concepts	to their experiences,			
through reflection and	needs and cultures"			
discussion about direct	(2.3.Culture.3)			
experiences with work	(2.5.0 antare.5)			
or what students "do"	"engages students and			
and know (Smith).	teachers in designing			
	and revising a learner-			
	centered curricular			
	program that integrates			
	program that integrates			
	basic and higher levels			
	of thinking throughout			
	and provides			
	opportunities for			
	students to emulate			
	professionals and			
	construct meaning as			
	they engage in a			
	thorough exploration			
	of a concept, problem,			
	of a concept, problem,			
	issue, or question"			
	(2.4.I.P.1)			
	"involves diverse			
	stakeholders in			
	uncovering issues that			
	challenge time spent			
	on quality instruction			
	and in innovative			
	approaches to dealing			
	with them" (2.4.I.P.3)			

Governance- Referring to the system by which members of the school identify problems, express preferences, generate hypothesis about action, and make decisions about the connection between the ends they desire and the means they intend to use to achieve them; what is to be done and how it is defined by the process by which a viable consensus is reached among all stakeholders as they work together for a stronger school	"explicitly links the school's vision and mission to programs and policies" (1.3.Culture.3)	"nurtures and sustains a culture of collaboration, trust, learning, and high expectations by providing structured opportunities for cross role groups to design and implement innovative approaches to improving learning, work and practice" (2.4.Cutlture.2)	"embeds, distributed leadership into all levels of the organization by enabling administrative, teacher, student and parent leaders to assume leadership roles and co-creates a process by which today's leaders identify, support and promote the leaders of tomorrow" (3.4.Capacity.2)		"generates goals that maximize on the principal's role in improving teacher practice, academic results, and/or school learning environment in the service of improving learning" (6.4.Uncovering.3)	
(Smith).						
Culture – A known design of a school which embodies a sense of identity and character and serves as a set of beliefs and practices (Smith) which are connected to the cultural side of school (Sergiovanni).				"promotes understanding, appreciation, and use of the community's diverse cultural, social, and intellectual resources through diverse activities" (4.3.Culture.1)		
Civic Capacity - The idea based organization whereby moral authority inspires all persons to take up a role of serving the enterprise (Sergiovanni) to attend to common problems collaboratively (Smith).	"collaborates with key stakeholders in the school to develop and implement a shared vision and mission for learning" (1.3.Culture.1)	"engage stakeholders in developing and sustaining a learning environment that actively involves students in meaningful, relevant learning that is clearly connected to their experiences, culture and futures, and requires them to construct meaning of concepts or processes in deductive or inductive ways (2.4.Culture.3)				

School Community- Demonstrating a large social responsibility (Cremin) which includes the schools and community (Smith). Learning Organization - A system that stimulates workers and managers to engage in experimentation(Spear s & Bowen).	t c c i v c c	'supports various teaming opportunities, common planning and inquiry time, and visitations within the organization to increase learning and	"promotes and protects the welfare and safety of students and staff" (3.3.Culture.1)	"builds and sustains positive relationships with families and caregivers" (4.3.Sustainability.1)		
s & Bowen).	i	improve practice" (2.3.Cutlure.1)				
Paradox of the System - Activities, connections and production flows in a Toyota factory are rigidly scripted, yet at the same time Toyota's operations are enormously flexible and adaptable(Spears & Bowen). Scientific Method - —	•	'gathers input from	"establishes process			
Detailed assessment of the current state of affairs and a plan for improvement with an experimental test of the proposed changes (Spears & Bowen).	s f f a r t t i i (staff and surveys students as well as formal assessment data as part of process to monitor and evaluate the impact of the instructional program" (2.3.S.P.P.1)	for the ongoing evaluation, monitoring and revision of management and operational systems, ensuring their continuous sustainable improvement" (3.4.Sustainability.1)			
Accountability - Accountability is the process through which public knowledge about school work is created. Its purpose is to test whether the selected means were sufficient to achieve the desired end. In this sense, public knowledge for	c a a t t t r F I F	'facilitates regular use of easily accessible assessment and accountability systems that enables students, teachers, and parents to monitor student progress, teacher learning, uncover patterns and trends, and provides a way to contextualize student			"enables an approach to "accountability" that upholds high ethical standards and inspires stakeholders (educators, parents, students and community partners) to own and be responsible for every students' academic and social success"	

accountability has both an informational reference and a value dimension. Public knowledge accounts both for what we understand what action led to results and what we value how well we like what we got as results (Smith).	achievement, both inside history and projected into the future" (2.4.Sustainability.1)		(5.4.Sustainability.1)		
Politicization of Education - The ideological battles that are forged and fought through educational institution (Cremin).			"promotes social justice and ensures that individuals student needs inform all aspects of schooling" (5.3.Culture.3)	"draws upon the perspectives, expertise and leadership of various stakeholders in responding proactively to emerging challenges to the shared vision, ensuring the resilience of the school, its growth, learning and improvements" (6.3.Sustainability.2)	
Organization - refers to the pattern of purposeful relations that exist among individuals within the boundaries of the school's sphere of interest. School behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated(Smith).					
Social Capacity- Ability of a social group to articulate and work towards resolving issues involving their common interest in quality schooling and a prosperous community life (Smith).		"promotes understanding, appreciation, and use of the community's diverse cultural, social, and intellectual resources through diverse activities" (4.4.Culture.1)			

Relational Trust – The quality of social relationships in school communities with regard to respect, trust, personal regard for others, competence and integrity in different role relationships (teachers with principals, teachers with parents, teachers with other teachers, teachers with students(Bryk &	"engages stakeholders representing all roles and perspective in the school in the development, monitoring and refinement of a shared vision and mission for learning" (1.4.Culture.1)			

Chapter V

Conclusions and Recommendations

The multidimensional rubric adopted by the State Education Department of New York State presents an evaluation of principals primarily from a leadership and governance perspective. The rubric communicates criteria for principals to emulate, as well as an assessment for rating. The perspective of the rubric includes attributes highlighted by a commitment to the instructional program, collaboration with the school community, and accountability. The rubric relies heavily on prescribing how principals are to approach educational leadership so that the roles are defined and expectations are met. The rubric, however, does not include comprehensive evaluation of attributes that measure social capacity or ones that explicitly promote a collaborative school culture. Even where the rubric attempts to address the school community, the measures do not contain much depth even for basic evaluation. That being said, it is recommended that more criteria for civic capacity be included. Paradox of the System and Organization were terms the researchers thought should be included in this type of rubric assessment. The description for the term Organization includes, "school behavior varies in the degree to which it is public and interdependent or is private and isolated." There was no language in the rubric to support this description. However, for this analysis it is a supporting trait for successful educational leaders.

Civic capacity attributes provide the ability to decentralize control and distribute leadership with new people who are valuable team members(Stone, 2003). This will provide opportunity for all stakeholders to contribute effectively to promote the success in the schools.

Additionally, the predominance of governance attributes suggests a perspective in how to hold others accountable. This may suggest too much emphasis on accountability and not enough on trust and competence necessary from educational leaders.

References

- Brandt, R. (1992). On Rethinking Leadership: A Conversation With Tom Sergiovanni. *Educational Leadership*, 49, 46-49.
- Bryk, A. & Schneider, B. (2002). *Trust in Schools: A Core Resource for Improvement*. New York, N.Y.:Russell Sage Foundation.
- Cremin, L. (1991). Popular Education and its Discontents. New York, N.Y.:Harper Collins.
- Hoyle, E. (1996). Politics of School Management. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton Book Company.
- Smith, F. (1995). School Improvement as Community Development: The Advocacy Design Center. Class notes (Summer 2012).
- Stone, C. (2003). *Civic Capapeity—What, Why, and Whence*. Draft Prepared for Institutions of Democracy: Public Education, Oxford University Press.